An Appraisal of Women Protection Laws & Factors Responsible for Frequent Enhancement of Domestic Violence against Women: An International Perspective

Jameela Saeed  Ph.D. Law Scholar/Candidate, Times Institute Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.
Shaukat Hussain Bhatti  Assistant Professor/HOD–Law, Times Institute Multan, Punjab, Pakistan.

Vol. 2, No. 4 (Fall 2022)
Pages: 340 – 351
ISSN (Print): 2789–441X
ISSN (Online): 2789–4428

Abstract: It is undeniable that women play a crucial role in families, societies, and nations, and it is difficult for communities to survive without them. This immutable realism is a natural phenomenon to comprehend societal goals. Domestic violence (IPV) is a problem that has had a long history and has evolved along with humanity. Despite several legal and punitive efforts, the issue persists and must be addressed to accomplish the intended consequences for societal cohesion by protecting the importance of women's rights. In addition to mental illness and women's depression brought on by domestic violence, society is also experiencing negative impacts that, in the end, prevent the achievement of sustainable development objectives by destroying the countries. Intimate partner violence (IPV) seems to be linked to the victims' personalities, yet its negative ramifications affect the whole community. This study will look at a situational analysis to see whether the present legislative framework is suitable by fixing flaws or in some other manner to accomplish the conditions for sustainable development goals.

Key Words

Corresponding Author: Jameela Saeed
Email: jameelasaeed2014@gmail.com

Introduction

The concern is so wise that its adverse effects are irrepressible and are causing to generate frequent social evils of a highly heinous nature. In other words, it would be justified to denote here that the captioned issue is one of the reasons that are causing to make a society vulnerable. To avert this vulnerability, overcoming and eradicating this problem needs the attention of this modern-era legislatures. (Bunch, 1990)Besides social stability and rehabilitation, the solution to this problem would be helpful to safeguard the victim women and their associated families from numerous complex situations at a later stage, which can avert multiple sorts of revenge situations.

"Violence against women is arguably the most objectionable and prevalent violation of human rights. It has no regard for racial, cultural, or economic barriers. ("Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention – ScienceDirect," n.d.–a)"

We cannot claim to be making genuine advancements toward equality, development, and peace as long as it persists.” a comparison study was conducted to determine the variations in the severity of violence against women among the three classes. (de Koker, Mathews, Zuch, Bastien, & Mason–Jones, 2014)The matter regarding the adoption of intersectionality is the idea that social designations such as race, style, and gender, when they apply to a particular person or group, are interconnected and can lead to multiple, interdependent components of discrimination or disadvantage. Scaffolding to evaluate the several
related categories of violence in women's life in Pakistan was obsessed by the spotlight on sexual characteristics and class. According to the study, all societal variables mentioned in earlier studies remain. They must be addressed if we get closer to achieving the Sustainable Development Goals by 2030. (Bunch, 1990). The Pakistani Constitution of 1973 codifies the core principles for a fair society with provisions such as equality for everyone, freedom from all sorts of exploitation and stereotyping, special protection for women and children, full involvement of women in all spheres of national life, and upliftment, among others. Unfortunately, violence against women and girls frequently happens in public and private situations. Under a large body of national and sub-national studies, gender-based violence is a regrettable and terrible phenomenon in contemporary Pakistan, where it is frequently solely justified in the name of culture, tradition, and morality. (de Koker et al., 2014). To proceed further for the accomplishment of this study regarding making a comprehensive review of past researchers and to execute the situational analysis of the ancient times with present-era legislations, the evaluation would be divided into parts, and this review of multiple/collective nature would analyze the turbulent phases in this regard. These phases would be as under:

**Introductory Phase**

- The introductory phase would cover women's status, rank, honor, dignity, and respect in Islam and by the West. Besides this, the stage would discuss the role of women in social rehabilitation and ascertain the outcomes for sustainable development goals by consulting the reality that a woman prepares a generation that plays a role in the survival and progress of existing as well as upcoming nations.
- This phase will also explore the legislative measures and some possible flaws.
- A comprehensive and brief sight of previous history in the sense of reviewing the literature is also a portion of this introductory phase.
- This phase will also explore the need for this study to meet the requirements for sustainable development goals.
- This portion will look at the situational analysis and compensatory steps by legislatures, rulers, legal authorities, and other social activists, including NGOs.
- The closing lines of this phase explore the possible benefits that could ascertain after eradicating this curse of IPV. It is essential because it relates to social rehabilitation besides safeguarding victims from the harsh behavior of cruel custodians.

**Research Methodology Phase**

- The captioned portion of this review will explore the adopted approach and sources utilized for data collection. It will include the data sources used to accomplish the task other than the multiple articles reviewed for this study.

**General Discussion Phase**

- This phase will discuss the turbulent stages from a historical and legal perspective and includes the status of women in the pre-Islamic era and after the dawn of Islam.
- Foundational Phases to Pre Islamic era
  - Pre Islamic History
  - Dawn of the Islamic era
  - Women of West
  - Women in Islam
- This phase will also make a comparative and situational analysis of the ancient and present.
- This phase will also cover the legislative flaws causing the enhancement of the ratio of IPV.
This portion will discuss and explore the remedial measures to discourage the situations.

This portion will explore the status of women in Asia and the West.

This phase will highlight the dominant status of women in Islam and how strapping applications of the injunctions of Islam can make an ideal society by ensuring the eradication of this curse from the community.

This phase will also explore the adverse effects of IPV on society by discussing how to ensure the community's rehabilitation by eradicating this curse.

What will discuss a cruel and soft state of mind in this phase? This portion will highlight the possible causes of IPV and their treatment.

The most critical exploration of this phase would be how many social evils are associated with this curse and how what can restore the situations either with reformed legislation or by strapping implications.

This phase will also discuss cultural, traditional, regional, social, and political interactions.

**Conclusion and Final remarks phase**

This phase would conclude the study by making a final situational analysis and extracting some crucial suggestions from executed review study.

The closing lines of this phase would invite other researchers and scholars to ensure social revolutions as the room is still empty.

Social rehabilitation is associated with several allied factors considered obligatory for accomplishing the desired errands regarding practical community reformation. (“Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention - ScienceDirect,” n.d.-a) The issue of intimate partner violence (IPV) is not new but is associated with and runs alongside human evolution. What carried out frequent legislation to overcome and eradicate the issue in question? Still, what could not achieve the desired outcomes to a satisfactory level, and the problem remained intact in its original format. (Richardson et al., 2022) The rise of the modern scientifically reformed era was expected for the Upgradation of the human mind in this regard. Still, the ratio of domestic violence recorded higher compared to ancient times and increased daily. Although the legislative bodies carried out the legislation keeping in view the regional, cultural, social, traditional, and religious perspectives, the IPV graph is increasing abnormally. (de Koker et al., 2014; “Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention - ScienceDirect,” n.d.-a; Torrisi, 2022a)

When women are discussed, it is definite that what cannot ensure social rehabilitation without the participation of women's role. (Jewkes, 2002a) When women are discussed from an Islamic point of view, it is clear that the honor and dignity of a woman are immortal and high. Islamic injunctions are awarded to women in such high ranks that western thoughts cannot give that dignity to women. But unfortunately, in Islamic states, the issue of IPV is dominant upon noncompliance with Islamic laws. (Torrisi, 2022a)

When the role of women in communal rehabilitation is taken under consideration, it would be the concluding line in honor of the women that a woman prepares a new generation, and the next generation is because of a woman. (Chaudhry et al., 2021; ‘Honor Killing’ Crimes in Pakistan: A Scenario Analyzed Under Legal and Human Rights Perspective, n.d.) Women are an integral part of every society, and what cannot be social rehabilitation without women's effective and practical role in society? As a consequence of this research, it will be necessary to improve laws and regulations to safeguard the public interest in sustainable development and universal rehabilitation. (“Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention - ScienceDirect,” n.d.-b)
Factors responsible for enhancing domestic violence demand early eradication for the best improvement of society and sustainable development goals. The need for this study is brought on by the need to resolve the problem by enacting new laws under the United Nations Conventions with a revised mechanism and agencies’ function to accomplish the task of rehabilitating society, upholding the supremacy of human rights, and restoring labor market outcomes. (“Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention – ScienceDirect,” n.d.-b; Peterman, Bleck, & Palermo, 2015)

Research Methodology

Even though the planned study may imply a descriptive focus on the pertinent provisions (legislations) successfully governing the bodies, it is only one of the analyses and proposals that will primarily be undertaken using qualitative research. Conducting legal research is more suited to the qualitative research methodology. A qualitative approach is a potent instrument for improving a legal researcher’s comprehension of discussion issues and obtaining more detailed information that may be challenging to get and communicate numerically. The global problem of violence against women is impacting women's lives. The Sustainable Development Goals also strongly emphasize gender equality and women's empowerment, which each nation is charged with ensuring within its borders. Due to the patriarchal system in Pakistan, which leads to widespread violence against women, women are particularly vulnerable to violence there. This study aims to identify the variables contributing to violence against women in Pakistan.

The informal rescue system that exists in some nations will also be looked at in this review. The authors will employ primary and secondary data sources to gather material. In addition to other pertinent publications, data sources will include court decisions, case law, citations of the Apex Courts and judgments of Special Courts, textbooks, statutes, articles from journals and law reviews, working papers, and online content. This study uses closed-ended and open-ended questionnaires, surveys, informal discussions, and interviews, which will be conducted in person, by phone, email, or any other method, for situational analysis and collecting primary data.

General Discussion

When the populace wanted "rights," the reign of King Babylon was a beacon of hope for the people in terms of establishing and acknowledging those rights. Besides the numerous redressals, the issue of rights regarding women was also discussed and granted. Gradually promoted legislative efforts in a very advanced format have secured the women of the modern era, yet she is badly facing the curse of domestic violence. (Bunch, 1990) The issue of Intimate partner violence is not new but has been travelling side by side from ancient times till to modern era. Domestic abuse and the treatment of women are global problems that threaten international peace and security by causing a variety of social ills. (de Koker et al., 2014; “Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention – ScienceDirect,” n.d.-a)

The legal structure for eradicating this problem does not allow for the identification and eradication of its covert existence, particularly in rural areas. In addition to violating international human rights, it also destroys society by jeopardizing social reintegration. (Jewkes, 2002a) Achieving sustainable development goals for universal rehabilitation with peace and security is the biggest obstacle. If what eliminated these corruptions, the sustainable development goals for 2030 could be accomplished effectively, whereas they couldn’t if they hadn’t grown from their roots. Captioned work conducted results from all of these causes, adding to the ongoing conversation about how to solve this issue. Better social rehabilitation and preserving peace and security depend on prioritizing human rights above the rule of law. Humanity’s fight for
ownership is not a recent phenomenon; it has existed since the beginning of time. After going through several stages, rights have come to be accepted in all communities around the globe. This phase of the captioned review discusses the postulates concisely to make the review beneficial for eradicating the issue in question for ascertaining the desired upshots. (Peterman et al., 2015)

Various causes cause the varying position of women across the globe. (Olusegun & Oyelade, 2022) Violence against women, motivated by societal, cultural, and psychological factors, is a trauma that harms women, their children, and their families worldwide. The captioned element persists despite pronouncements like the UDHDR and CEDAW protecting all women’s human rights. It is bursting with contemporary features. (BELL & GOODMAN, 2001a) The Pakistani government has made it clear that it considers violence against women and girls a significant violation of their fundamental human rights, guaranteed by Pakistan’s Constitution in both letter and spirit. It is also a violation of International conventions of the United Nations convened for upholding human rights on domestic and international levels. (Bunch, 1990) To show their commitment to the cause of eradicating all kinds of discrimination, violence, and injustice against women and girls and its many expressions, succeeding administrations have ratified several international agreements. (BELL & GOODMAN, 2001a) Among these are the Beijing Declaration and Platform for Action, the Sustainable Development Goals, the International Covenant on Social, Economic, and Cultural Rights, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, and the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW). (Covington & Co-Director, n.d.; Hart, n.d.)

**Violence against Women**

As a consequence of worldwide proletariat fears from women’s organizations, the CEDAW committee reported the violence problem on a global scale in 1991. The "United Nations Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women" was adopted by the U.N. in 1993. It is a worldwide problem that often affects societies where males are granted power and women are seen as property (Babur, 2007, p. 21). It is the worst human rights violation in every nation, culture, class, ethnicity, and age (Azhar et al., 2012, p. 1617). It is at its deadliest when combined with other oppressions of different kinds, including racial, socioeconomic, and cultural oppressions (Bunch, 1990, p.489). These violent incidents also happened on the streets, in prisons, and in government buildings.(Iverson, Shenk, & Fruzzetti, 2009)

The prevalence of intimate partner violence against women (VAW) was also reported by WHO (2013, p. 16), which found that the region with the most unprecedented rates of violence is Africa, followed by the Eastern Mediterranean and South East Asia. America’s regions have the next-highest average. According to WHO (2013), prevalence is also lower in high-income areas such as Western Pacific and Europe. (BELL & GOODMAN, 2001b)

**Element of violence against women and ascertainment of Sustainable Development Goals, 2030**

Justice and equality are necessary for peace; their lack leads to social discord and annoyance. The United Nations presented a new agenda with "win-win" collaboration and global development in 2015, with 17 Sustainable Development objectives and 169 targets that went into effect on January 1st, 2016. (Peterman et al., 2015) These objectives are the product of more than two years of worldwide stakeholder and civil society collaboration to help the most disadvantaged. These objectives and targets reflect a global vision of ambition and transformation. To create a world with equality by assisting the most vulnerable people, like women and girls, to have gender equality, the Sustainable Development Goals and
Targets are relevant and integrated internationally and for all nationalities. (Jewkes, 2002b) All of the new Sustainable Development Goals are tied to one another within its framework, and this objective addresses the empowerment and equality of women alongside other aims, including poverty, inequality, and a stable society. (Bell & Goodman, 2001b, 2001a)

An overview of Extrinsic and Intrinsic Factors concerning IPV or Violence against Women

Extrinsic Factors
Azam and Irma (2008, pp. 200–201) identify extrinsic elements as the setting where violence against women occurs. Hierarchies of power, male dominance, and control are a few external causes of VAW. (Jewkes, 2002a)

Intrinsic Factors
Personal traits, including age, education, income, the effect of personality, and acceptance of violence, are known as intrinsic factors. Younger women are more susceptible to violence from intimate partners. The 15–19 age group is the most vulnerable, whereas women over 50 are less likely to experience violence because they have higher confidence levels. It is why women over 50 experience less violence in low- and middle-income nations. On the other hand, poverty may increase women’s susceptibility to violent situations and hinder their ability to leave abusive situations. (Jewkes, 2002b) It plays a significant role in developing, maintaining, and enhancing violence against women. However, it is not just poor women who experience violence.

Factors responsible for an abnormal increase in domestic violence in the Digital era of aware society
The primary causes of the increase in IPV, domestic violence, or violence against women are given below. After overcoming these obstacles, what may resolve the problem mentioned in the caption, and can the ratio be reduced to an acceptable level? Avoiding several associated social issues will put the situation within a reasonable range and enable society to be readily healed. Conquering and eliminating the aforementioned linked elements may aid in eliminating the related social illnesses, making it more straightforward to achieve sustainable development objectives. (Carlen, 2013) If these flaws are fixed, domestic society will be more compatible from an international standpoint, and what will realize the anticipated results? Treatment with captions would benefit both the family and the community as a whole. (De Koker et al., 2014; “Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention – ScienceDirect,” n.d.-a)

i. Lack of Education is one of the responsible factors for the captioned issue.

ii. Poverty is another factor that is the leading cause to enhance brutality and domestic violence.

iii. Women’s inferiority is also one of the issues.

iv. Interference between outsiders and family members

v. The element of dominancy of males is a most essential and irreparable issue.

vi. Women’s patience toward abuse

vii. Workplace harassment is also an associated element that must be redressed. (Bushway & Reuter, 2008)

viii. Religious caste difference is a problem of sensitive nature.

ix. Love marriage is also an essential issue that has become more common and easily than in ancient times. Social media is playing its role in promoting this issue more effectively, which is alarming for society.

x. Dowry System and the Dower Issues are also the cause of the enhancement of frequent violence against women/IPV.

xi. Harassment is the leading cause of this brutality. (Raynor, Justice, & Robinson, 2009)

xii. Extra marital affair is also one reason for
enhancing domestic violence/IPV. Besides awakening religious and moral awareness in women, social media is again held responsible for this factor. (Maruna, 2011)

The last opportunities to participate in political activities are the fundamental cause of the unequal power distribution between the sexes in Pakistan is the nearly universal male dominance of the country's social structures. Men commit acts of violence against women to oppress them and reduce their status in society because it is male-dominated. They lack control over their goods or don't participate in group-based savings and credit programs, another factor linked to domestic violence, due to their poor social empowerment position. They can find social assistance from organizations in various social systems from time to time. Still, the restrictions placed on women's activities, outside movements, and interactions with others make them more isolated in their society. (Jewkes, 2002b)

**Role of women in Sustainable Development Goals**

The need for additional legislation to ensure the implication of a reformed mechanism is the compulsory requirement of the era for effectively accomplishing the task for desired outcomes. The alkylation of rights from definitions by many jurists will help comprehend the core of rights. (Jewkes, 2002a) The social implications and necessity of these rights would then be examined as part of this study to see how much the term "right" may contribute to societal stability or rehabilitation. (Bushway & Reuter, 2008; ‘Honor Killing’ Crimes in Pakistan: A Scenario Analyzed Under Legal and Human Rights Perspective, n.d.)

The fundamental issues that politics and governance are meant to address frequently touch on rights. These socio-political institutions have typically developed in a dialectical connection with rights. (Wemmers, n.d.)

Whether a civilization is sophisticated or not, women are essential to every society. Since ancient times, the development of women's rights has been challenging, and its history has been marked by upheaval up until the present. (Hussain Bhatti, Hussain, & Salman, 2022) However, there are still a lot of problems with the inference. Divine laws have acknowledged and established women's rights since the first woman walked the planet. (Bushway & Reuter, 2008) The majority of women experience frequent rights violations. Despite several national and international rules, problems still put women in danger, even in this day and age. When Pakistan's community is considered, the conditions are at their worst, particularly in tribal/agency areas, Baluchistan, and Southern Punjab. (Bushway & Reuter, 2008; Hussain Bhatti et al., 2022)

Pakistan ratified international conventions and treaties, in addition to those that concern the teachings and propagation of Islam. However, the situation still has to be rectified. This study will examine the global validity of women's rights in Pakistani society by looking at Islamic and Western ideas. (Maruna, 2011) This study will read the current conditions of the problem mentioned in the title by conducting a thorough analysis of ancient times and considering potential solutions to ensure the achievement of the desired results for the progressive accomplishment of social tasks related to the 2030 Sustainable Development Goals of the United Nations. (Sarwar, Ali, Bhatti, & Rehman, 2021)

The notion that women and girls frequently experience gender-based discrimination, which elevates their risk of poverty, violence, poor health, and illiteracy, is mirrored in women's rights. It is also reflected in these rights because men and women have quite different experiences. (Xue et al., 2021) The rights of women are an essential component of all human rights. The advocacy work of Amnesty International for women's rights covers a broad spectrum of human rights. They relate to the egalitarian
demands of women, working to create greater freedoms and opportunities for all women while also putting an end to the mistreatment of particular groups of women and girls. (Bunch, 1990; "Intimate Partner Violence: Causes and Prevention – ScienceDirect,” n.d.-a)

The Preamble to the 1945-approved United States Charter reaffirms "faith in basic human rights, in the dignity and value of the human person, in the equal rights of men and women and nations great and small." (Justice, University, Meares, & Law School, n.d.) To "achieve multinational cooperation in promoting and supporting respect for human rights and basic freedoms for all, without distinction as to race, sex, language, or religion," as stated in the UN Charter, is one of the organization’s objectives. (de Koker et al., 2014)

Many countries that ratified CEDAW nevertheless retain discriminatory laws governing marriage, land, property, and inheritance. While specific industries have witnessed improvements, many of the issues and obstacles identified in 1995 are still in place. New problems that have emerged in the previous ten years that influence women's empowerment and gender equality must be addressed more forcefully. (Bunch, 1990) A few instances include the feminization of the AIDS epidemic, migration, and the rise in women’s trafficking. (Feeley & School, n.d.)

Fundamental freedoms and human rights belong to everyone, and it is the responsibility of governments to protect and enhance these rights. (Bunch, 1990; ‘Honor Killing’ Crimes in Pakistan: A Scenario Analyzed Under Legal and Human Rights Perspective, n.d.) An International Conference on Human Rights has reiterated the solemn commitment of all States to uphold their duty to encourage the universal respect for and observance of all human rights and fundamental freedoms for all, as mandated by the United Nations Charter, other human rights instruments, and international law. (Olusegun & Oyelade, 2022; Torrisi, 2022b)

**Situational Analysis**

Historiography is a clear depiction of the situations of the captioned issue in question that have become worse compared to ancient times. Modern scientific technologies did not reduce the problem and its allied social evils but caused or enhanced the issue and its associated curses because of its adverse utilization and weaker algorithm. In the present case, the role of journalism and social media cannot be regarded as positive. Still, eradicating the factors mentioned earlier that are causing the enhancement of the curse of IPV or domestic violence in society is not decreased by the operation of social media and other forms of media. (BELL & GOODMAN, 2001b; Covington & Co-Director, n.d.)

The results of this review’s situational analysis have advanced the research to the point where they support the claim that, regardless of whether a state is on the list of developed nations, the type and ratio of IPV are comparable in virtually all conditions. Impartial analysis has shown an alarming situation on an international level. (Iverson et al., 2009; Peterman et al., 2015) Hence, the need for eradicating this curse along with allied curses is not only for any specified state but is a common requirement for all states of the globe.

**Phase to discuss the remedial measures for its Effective Eradication**

This phase is a crucial part of this composite/multiple review types on the topic in the heading. It will explore potential solutions that may be successful in resolving the issue, as well as the rapid eradication of the associated social ills, in guaranteeing social rehabilitation and establishing sustainable development objectives in the best interests of the state of
Pakistan and for the peace and security of other nations. (Hussain Bhatti et al., 2022)

1. State agencies should ensure the promulgation of fundamental rights as guaranteed by the Constitution of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan, 1973. (Bunch, 1990)

2. The portion of the “Principles of Policy” must be declared as the pat of fundamental Rights so that what could ensure effective accomplishment of human rights for the progressive achievement of social/state errands in international interest.

3. What must ensure the strict implication of existing municipal laws in domestic

4. ally?

5. What must observe the application of criminological theories in a real sense and practical manner to ensure social rehabilitation and uphold the supremacy of the rule of law?

6. Awareness campaigns and control over the use of social media with robust algorithms must be observed, and in case of noncompliance by the users, what must initiate strict actions against them. This step will discourage the promotion of most factors that are significant causes for the spread of this curse. (Bunch, 1990)

Conclusion and Final Remarks

Despite being brief and detailed, the conclusion states that women's rights do not predominate in society. The issue impacts developed and developing nations, and the organization suffers several other wrongdoings and instability. Pakistan has the worst circumstances, notably in the vast interior of Baluchistan, KPK, and the southern parts of the nation. What obstacle still stands in Pakistan after subsequent legislation? Social operation is a vital step in society's rehabilitation for the gradual completion of civic duties and the identification of sustainable development objectives to eradicate the evils that lead to women’s plight. (‘Honor Killing’ Crimes in Pakistan: A Scenario Analyzed Under Legal and Human Rights Perspective, n.d.)

To protect women from domestic violence and to give them medical, judicial, and legal support, what should develop new plans and interventional maps in society in collaboration with members of the health team, religious and societal leaders, NGOs, the police department, and people from other similar groups. It's crucial to carry out this strategy. Applying criminological theories may be the best fit to accomplish the desired outcomes. (Hussain Bhatti et al., 2022; Thank et al., 2003)

The researcher anticipates and expects that this study will encourage debate and more research to enhance laws, policies, and programs. It will be a guidebook for decision-makers in the public and commercial sectors, as well as for academics, social scientists, and economists, and it will add to the body of knowledge on the subject. (‘Honor Killing’ Crimes in Pakistan: A Scenario Analyzed Under Legal and Human Rights Perspective, n.d.)

This review's last line invites others to fill the space left for social rehabilitation.

References


An Appraisal of Women Protection Laws & Factors Responsible for Frequent Enhancement of Domestic Violence against Women: An International Perspective


Feeley, M. M., & School, Y. L. (n.d.). *TWO MODELS OF THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM: AN ORGANIZATIONAL PERSPECTIVE.*


Resources—Globalization-Environmental Quality Nexus: Fresh Insights from South Asian Countries. Sustainability, 13(8), 4224. [1]

https://doi.org/10.3390/su13084224